

Alternative Compensation Systems for Teachers



**Prepared by the Office of Legislative
Research and General Counsel
September 27, 2007**

Alternative Compensation Systems for Teachers

- What research says about performance pay for teachers
- What Teacher Quality organizations recommend
- Examples of alternative compensation systems
- Lessons learned



What Research Says

Evaluation literature on performance-based pay for teachers:

- ◆ is slender
- ◆ generally finds positive achievement effects
- ◆ is not sufficiently robust to prescribe how systems should be designed, e.g., optimal size of bonus, individual vs. group incentives

Source: Podgursky, M.J. and M. G. Springer, "Teacher Performance Pay: A Review," National Center on Performance Incentives, October 24, 2006.

What Teacher Quality Organizations Recommend

Design Elements

1. Ongoing, Job-Embedded Professional Development
2. Performance-Based Compensation
3. Evaluation Based on Professional Standards
4. Career Advancement Options

What Teacher Quality Organizations Recommend Regarding Performance Based Compensation

- **Multiple measures of teacher performance**
- **Objective measures of student achievement**
- **Incentives available to all teachers at a school**
- **Performance rewards are significant**
- **Consider all perspectives on finances**

What Teacher Quality Organizations Recommend Related to Evaluation Systems

- **Credible, agree-upon standards of practice**
- **Evaluation system facilitates support and feedback**
- **Multiple evaluators, multiple evaluations**
- **System must ensure inter-rater reliability**

What Teacher Quality Organizations Recommend

Implementation Recommendations

1. Sufficient and stable funding
2. Input from, and clear communication with, teachers and administrators
3. Skilled leadership – principles, master and mentor teachers and coaches
4. Target high-need schools and subjects
5. Include a program evaluation and monitoring system
6. Integrate and align other systems to compensation system

Denver ProComp

Base salary plus add-ons for

- ◆ Professional development units completed, graduate degrees, and national licenses
- ◆ Satisfactory evaluation
- ◆ Teaching in a hard to staff position or hard to serve school
- ◆ Student growth



Teacher Advancement Program (TAP)

- Created by the Milken Family Foundation to attract talented people to the teacher profession, develop their skills, and retain them
- Schools apply to become TAP schools and are selected based on their ability to implement, fund, and sustain the program
- Teachers must vote to become a TAP school
- In 2007-08, over 180 U.S. schools are implementing TAP



Teacher Advancement Program (TAP)

- Multiple career paths enabling teachers to stay in classroom
- Ongoing applied professional development as determined by analyzing classroom performance evaluations and student data
- Four or more evaluations by trained evaluators based on validated teaching rubrics
- Performance-based compensation as determined by:
 - ◆ Multiple evaluations
 - ◆ Classroom-level achievement growth using value-added model
 - ◆ School-level achievement growth using value-added model



Minnesota Q Comp

Alternative teacher pay agreement must:

- describe career advancement options
- reform the “steps and lanes” salary by basing at least 60% of any compensation increase on teachers’ performance using:
 - ◆ school wide student achievement gains;
 - ◆ measures of student achievement; and
 - ◆ individual teacher evaluations using multiple criteria conducted by a trained evaluation team
- provide ongoing site-based professional development led during the school day by trained teacher leaders

Texas Educator Excellence Grant

Eligible Campuses:

Ranking within top ½ of campuses with highest percentage of educationally disadvantaged students

and

Rating of Exemplary or Recognized

or

Ranking within top quartile of comparable campuses in reading and math improvement



Texas Educator Excellence Grant

Campus use of grant funds:

**75% for
Teacher
Incentives**

- Required criteria:
 - ◆ Teacher's or team's success in improving student performance using objective, quantifiable measures and
 - ◆ Collaboration with faculty and staff that contributes to improving overall student performance on campus
- Optional criteria:
 - ◆ Teacher's assignment in a critical shortage area
 - ◆ Demonstration of ongoing involvement in activities directly resulting in improved student performance
- Teacher incentives should be \$3,000 - \$10,000

**25% for
other
incentives
and
programs**

- Incentives for other school personnel
- Other programs proven to recruit and retain effective teachers

Florida Merit Award Program

- Merit-based pay supplements to top instructional personnel and school-based administrators equal to 5%-10% of average teacher pay in district
- 60% of merit award based on student academic proficiency or gains in learning, or both, as measured by:
 - ◆ statewide standardized tests; or
 - ◆ for grades and subjects not measured by statewide assessment program, national, state, or district-determined assessments
- 40% of merit award based on evaluation of professional practices using criteria adopted by local school boards
- Subject to negotiation with teacher union



Lessons Learned

- Consider the capacity of the state education department to provide technical assistance
- Are the data and data systems available to objectively measure teacher performance?
- Teacher support is needed to sustain a performance-based compensation system.